

Research Trends on Higher Education Internationalization in Mainland China: From the Perspective of Literature Review

Chundi Liu¹ and Feng Yan^{2*}

¹*Advanced Vocational Technical College, Shanghai University of Engineering Science, Shanghai, 200437, China*

²*School of Media and Design, Shanghai JiaoTong University, Shanghai, 200240, China*

E-mail: ¹<chundiliu@sues.edu.cn>, ^{2}<fyan@sjtu.edu.cn>*

KEYWORDS Education Globalization. Higher Education. International Cooperation. Mainland China. Research Trends. Transnational Education

ABSTRACT In the past three decades, a lot of progress has been made in higher education internationalization in Mainland China. By December 2016, 2411 organizations and projects of Chinese-foreign cooperation in running schools have been established with the support of the Ministry of Education. In this paper, research trends have been conducted based on the research in the field of higher education internationalization in Mainland China. There are altogether 8 issues, which have been classified. These 8 issues have been analyzed based on their similarities and also their differences. Adopting a synthetic and overview angle, this paper concentrates on how these issues are going to be analyzed. Besides, it also focuses on how these issues are evolved. Last but not the least, this paper also focuses on the results generated from the research.

INTRODUCTION

With the rapid development of economy science and technology, higher education internationalization has become a hot trend. The way of higher education internationalization is becoming more and more numerous, despite growing concerns about the consequences (Le-Ha and Barnawi 2015). India set out a conceptual framework of international cooperation in higher education through branch campuses (Gopinath 2015). To attract talents, some European higher education institutions competed with each other by predicting the multi-level model (Lepori et al. 2015). During the thirty-six years since reform and opening-up policies were implemented, comparatively speaking, the Chinese-foreign cooperation projects in running schools in the sector of higher education is developing at a roaring speed. By December 2016, 2411 organizations and projects of Chinese-foreign cooperation in running schools have been established with the support of the Ministry of Education. There are 31 municipalities directly under the administration of the Central Government, autonomous regions and provinces being covered. Most of them are in the higher education field. It is bound to be taking place under the background

of the economic globalization, higher education internationalization and the national policy of making the higher education more accessible to the majority of young people (Chow and Loo 2015; Stein et al. 2016).

The Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools in the sector of higher education in Mainland China have been developing in a hard way over the past thirty years (Stein 2016; Pashby and de Oliveira 2016).

Generally speaking, it is still in the exploration period. In this course, progress is the key tone. A lot of progress has been achieved, including innovate the school system and promote the reforms in higher education, provide more education resources and satisfy people's various need for education, develop different talent-training patterns, and therefore, provide many professionals for the economic and social development of the nation.

However, problems have been inevitably showing up on the way of development. For instance, it is hard to guarantee that all the education resources introduced from foreign countries are of the same sound level, the distribution of cooperative programs is not reasonable regarding regions, subjects and courses, teachers' levels and qualities vary, the non-profit prin-

principle is not fully implemented in the cooperation, there are some leaks in admission management, and the degree authentication system leaves space for further improvement, some are poor at quality so that the students and parents think the large amount of tuition is not worthwhile, and some students and parents complain that foreign diploma and the promise of going abroad for further study cannot be guaranteed. These problems are unavoidable during the process of development. However, more problems are not necessarily bad signs because no problems indicate without progresses. Reforms, innovations and development are bound to get along with new problems that are supposed to be solved instead of being avoided or shut out of the door (Engwall 2016).

The Ministry of Education carried out the projects of Chinese-foreign cooperation among running schools in 2004 right after the implementation of the projects of Chinese-foreign cooperation promoted by running schools back in 2003, advised the Ministry of Education regarding the problems arise from Chinese-foreign cooperation in running schools in 2006, announcement from the Ministry of Education to further regulate the order of Chinese-foreign cooperation in running schools in 2007, announcement from the Ministry of Education to carry out the assessment of Chinese-foreign cooperation in running schools in 2009, so as to strengthen the legal management and improve the ability of running cooperative schools. All of the progresses and achievements have indicated the wisdom of the decision-making departments.

The executive meeting held by the state council approved the medium-to-long-term education reform and development plan (2010-2020) in an executive meeting of the state council on 5 May, 2010 indicating a new historical starting point and a new development period of the Chinese-foreign cooperation in running schools. It outlines the general plan and claims the specific requirements of Chinese-foreign cooperation in running schools. It points out that it is necessary to promote opening-up of education to the outside world and strengthen international exchange and cooperation, develop education reforms in the nation by taking advantage of advanced education theories and experience so as to improve the competitiveness in the world, and train a group of talents with global views who

are able to deal with international affairs and competitions. The country shall introduce education resources with high quality and attract renowned foreign school, education and research institutes as well as enterprise to cooperatively set up teaching, practice and research institutes and projects.

Objectives

To Point Out the Current Status of Higher Education Internationalization in Mainland China

As a matter of fact, the Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools in the sector of high education in Chinese mainland have achieved great results during last thirty years.

To Classify Central Issues of Higher Education Internationalization in Mainland China

To promote the reliability of this paper, there are 629 journal papers being reviewed and analyzed, including research reports and postgraduate dissertations published between 1980 and 2016.

To Forecast Research Trends of Higher Education Internationalization in Mainland China

The lessons learned and achievements made during the application of these projects in the high education sector deserve to be analyzed and explored.

METHODOLOGY

Samples of this research are selected from the digital database via keyword searching. There are majorly two databases used in this research, including CQVIP and CNKI, which is a well-known digital library in China. There are more than 2,600 journal papers concerning the Chinese-foreign cooperation projects in running schools, including research reports and postgraduate dissertations being published from 1980 to 2016. Among these 2,600 journal papers, 629 of them were chosen as studying samples. To analyze the status quo, the Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated in running

schools in the sector of higher education in Chinese mainland, all the selected papers have been classified into 8 categories, which are discussed in the following part.

OBSERVATION AND DISCUSSION

The Current Status of Chinese-foreign Cooperation Projects Operated by Running Schools among Higher Education in Mainland China

The status quo of Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools in the sector of higher education in Chinese mainland has been widely analyzed by Chinese researchers. Lu et al. (2013) depicted the basic development of the policies of Chinese-foreign cooperation in running schools. What is more is that based on the data released by the Ministry of Education, it analyzes the current situation and existing problems of it and gives corresponding suggestions. Some also analyzed the current status of Chinese-foreign cooperation in running schools and indicated that the quality construction of Chinese-foreign cooperation in school running has become a distinct theme in the new stage. Therefore, in accordance with the orientation of taking Chinese-foreign cooperation in school running as the component of educational enterprise in China, one must innovate the quality concept and quality standard adapted to the new stage of development of Chinese-foreign cooperation in school running, focus on quality and explore the construction of quality assurance system and its operation mechanism with Chinese characteristics linking to the international standards. The four mechanisms of quality assurance such as access mechanism, classification regulatory mechanism, evaluation and certification mechanism, punishment and withdrawing mechanism should be constructed (Lin and Liu 2013).

Some researchers presented the mode of Chinese-foreign cooperation in school running in higher education contains talent training, teaching management, international collaboration, comprehensive management and virtuous development (Wei 2012).

Results obtained from these researches have illustrated that visual progress has been made in the field of Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools among

higher education institutions in Chinese mainland. Most importantly, Chinese-foreign cooperation in running schools in higher education has played a critical role in education globalization and internationalization. However, researchers also conducted studies concerning some common difficulties, taking supporting policies, effective teaching and quality construction as examples.

Higher education internationalization cannot be looked at as an essential service, the assessment and evaluation of higher education internationalization in practice should be researched more, especially on some aspects such as financing and so on. Some creative thinking ways and innovative methods will be popular (Delbanco 2015; Estacio and Karic 2015; Suleyman 2015; Takalani and Humbulani 2015), and some common difficulties are explored by researchers as well, such as quality construction, the effective teaching, and supporting policies.

Development Background and Meaning Chinese-foreign Cooperation Projects Operated by Running Schools among Higher Education in Mainland China

These literatures mainly discussed the meaning, influence and problems of Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools in lights of internalization of higher education, economic globalization as well as China's entering into WTO and other aspects.

Some experts believed that the country should speed up the Chinese-foreign cooperation process after China's entering the WTO. WTO intensified internationalization of education trend, while only in-depth study and effective action is the best choice. In the international trend of higher education, the impact is mainly from four aspects, that is, to update education concept, from close to opening, to promote innovation in Higher Education, from the "Official Legal System" to "Pluralism", to promote the expansion of higher education functions, from the "edge" of the society to the "axis" of the society, and to promote change in education system, from the "one-way circulation" to "stand cross-body style" running style (Shahjahan and Madden 2015).

Some thought that one must improve competitiveness facing the education internationalization of higher education. Along with the

good opportunity to bring great development in the course of Chinese-foreign cooperation in running schools, there are also some problems, that is, some areas spamming foreign diplomas, some areas existing the illegal enrollment and low-quality teaching, and without effective instruction one just copies the mode of foreign countries totally. Therefore, there have five suggestions following based on the country itself, do not belittle, that is, strong cooperation is important, but the strength of the joint is also necessary, to improve graft, not “blind species”, to enhance predictability and avoid repetition settings, and to use “Western style” to promote the education reform (Samier 2015).

Some believed it is inevitable for the higher education to become internationalized because of the economic globalization. He stressed to adhere to the correct direction of Chinese-foreign cooperation in running schools in higher education in mainland China, to prevent economic interests completely, to be carefully chosen cooperative education partners, adjust curriculum, establish training educational goals of international talents, and strengthen policy control, and improve relevant legal system (Deschamps and Lee 2015).

Some professors pointed out that teaching philosophy collision between the two sides of cooperative education is mainly in the following two points, that is, learning environment, interpersonal environment, and care must be taken on the following aspects of students’ roles in different teaching philosophy of dislocation, foreign teaching philosophy requiring systematization, and do not blindly copy totally (Ning 2015).

China has paid more emphasis on human spirits in higher education globalization. More and more researchers think that higher education internationalization is meaningful for the country’s culture and security problem and even its competitiveness. Some new form of internationalization in higher education has occurred (Mok 2015; Hu 2016).

Mode of Chinese-foreign Cooperation Projects Operated by Running Schools among Higher Education in Mainland China

Some experts pointed out that in recent years, three main modes have been formed according to the Chinese-foreign cooperation projects op-

erated by running schools in the sector of higher education. Converged modes include, first, the introduction of other teaching plans, curricula, textbooks and related teaching methods, then, hiring other teachers to give lectures, one can send teachers to the foreign part improving their teaching abilities, third, the introduction of other teaching methods such as classroom discussions, practice teaching, case teaching, and fourth, bilingual teaching, and graft type mode. Students can learn in a Chinese university and foreign university in different semesters with a mutual opening course, mutual recognition of credits, mutual conferred diploma, and loose mode. One can hire foreign teachers or send the teachers go abroad to learn from foreign experiences. One can also send students abroad for short-term study or internships. Thus, the country can achieve international standards of teaching and instruction (Allemann 2014; Anoshkova 2015).

Others considered that the mode of Chinese-foreign cooperation in running schools in higher education can be divided into three categories of open and distance education, introduce the project and foreign institutions to set up campuses, and cited high-quality education resources into cooperative education (Jokila 2015; Araya et al. 2015).

Yang (2014) believed that modes adopted by the Chinese-foreign cooperation operated by running schools in the sector of higher education can be classified into two categories, including the running and cooperation modes. Cooperation model can be divided into one to one and one to more cooperation, school to school and school to enterprise cooperation, independent institutions and non-independent agency, unilateral investment and bilateral investment, local cooperation and overall cooperation, and mainly of foreign teachers and mainly of Chinese teachers. Running mode contains academic education and non-academic education, single campus and dual campus, full-time and part-time, introduce cooperation and without introduction of cooperation, single and double diploma, and planned enrollment and un-planned enrollment.

China should implement different modes and learn from other countries. Characteristics of higher education globalization and internationalization should be sum up and apply widely, and then popular mode will see increasing

progress (Anderson 2015; Larsen 2015; Stukalova et al. 2015; Zhadovets 2015).

Management of Chinese-foreign Cooperation Projects Operated by Running Schools among Higher Education in Mainland China

From 2000, more and more studies have been conducted on the research of management of Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools in the sector of higher education from many aspects such as student management, teacher management, tuition management and quality management.

Student Management

Some researchers thought in recent years that students in Chinese-foreign cooperation in running schools have increased rapidly. It is rather obvious that student management is of great importance to the Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools in the sector of higher education. Then he examined the student groups' features and found many problems including student management starting late, a misunderstanding occurring, and irrational organization structure. Finally, he suggested that one should clear orientation, optimize the organizational structure, introduce high-quality resources and build a network platform to enhance specialized construction of student management (Yemini 2015).

Some considered Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools in the sector of higher education have made significant progress because of education modernization. She analyzed the weakness of student management of Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools in the sector of higher education. Then realized that ideological and political education is weak, students have large learning pressure, such students are easy to form small groups, Chinese students sense of belonging are not very strong. Based on such circumstances, one should attach importance to training full-time counselors so as to carry out ideological and political education effectively. One should explore suitable student management system of own accord, and one should enrich student activities to improve their overall quality (Gopal and Zha 2015).

Dong (2012) gave some suggestions on the student moral education on the basis of a questionnaire analysis of Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools in the sector of higher education and recognize to strengthen the construction of seven aspects of strengthen the study of political theory, develop good habits of civilization and improve the quality of college freshmen, strengthen freshmen education, strengthening discipline legal awareness, strengthen communication with parents and raise progressive positive spirit, strengthen civilization classes and student cadres construction, enhance professional knowledge and learning, actively participate in social practice, strengthen student-centered teaching, to create a good atmosphere of foreign language for students, and strengthen mental health education and mental health counseling.

China still faces student mobility in higher education globalization and internationalization (Larrinaga and Amurrio 2015; Castro et al. 2016).

Teacher Management

Li (2012) learned from some foreign countries such as Germany. Afterward, he made an analysis over the status quo of China's school-teachers in the projects of Chinese-foreign cooperation operated by running schools in the sector of higher education. At last he proposed some countermeasures including improve and perfect the management system of foreign teachers and optimize the overall structure of foreign school faculty, strengthen the evaluation system of foreign school faculty, and increase funding in the construction of school teachers.

Some believed that during the teaching process of Chinese-foreign cooperation in running schools in higher education, the quality of teaching depends largely on the quality of foreign teachers. Through empirical research on Chinese-foreign cooperatively foreign teachers, he put forward five-point proposal including foreign teachers should be full-time excellent teachers from the foreign partners so as to ensure teaching quality, specialized training is necessary, build excitement mechanisms to stable outstanding foreign teachers, Chinese operator should make a normal foreign teachers hiring standard, and create an international environment, so that foreign teachers in China will feel at home (Goldstein 2014).

Tuition Management

Some investigators considered that Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools in the field of higher education has different features on the geographical distribution, educational level, diploma conferred, student developing and other aspects. He also analyzed some problems occurred during school diploma awarded, asymmetric information, primary education rights, the scope of cooperation and tuition management in the course of Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools in the field of higher education (Goldstein 2014).

Wang (2010) cited the Foreign Trade University, City College of Zhejiang University City, Jilin University-Lambton College, Chinese-U.K. Joint College of Nanchang University, Beijing Institute of Technology, and other 10 cases, pointing out some problems on tuition management, including different education institutions (projects) in tuitions without a uniform standard, foreign exchange management problem, expenditure on management issues, definition of property assets authority, and management authority.

Some pointed out the motivation of Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools in the field of higher education in mainland China as, grab the international education market and the talents in the world, economic interests, and generous social benefits, to expand the visibility in the world (Sevilla 2015).

Kang (2012) defined education of Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools in the field of higher education in Chinese Mainland as an education production product, and its nature is still quasi-public goods. After the discussion of relations between education products and education industry, he pointed out that Chinese-foreign cooperation running schools in higher education has both the public nature and the product nature. So tuition can be regarded as exchange market price of education product.

Song (2011) believed the property of Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools in the field of higher education in Mainland China is unique, and she also admitted that it is objective and necessary to allow profit in the process of Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools in

the field of higher education in the mainland of China.

Others put forward the principles of tuition management in Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools in the field of higher education in Mainland China. He proposed a tuition program based on the cost of per student comparing several tuition modes (Chang 2015).

Quality Management

Some researchers said, in the last ten years, the numbers of Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools in the field of higher education in Mainland China has increased rapidly, but we should not ignore the quality at the same time. From the perspective of long-term development, we should build a scientific, comprehensive and strict quality monitoring system (Xia 2016).

Some discussed the significance of teaching quality evaluation in the cultivation of high quality, having innovation spirit talents in Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools in the field of higher education in Mainland China. He proposed the education quality evaluation system combined with successful cases of Nanjing University of cooperative education. The education quality evaluation system should include the following four parts of evaluation mission to assess teaching, science research of cooperative education, evaluation of basis-establishing scientific and effective evaluation standards, methods and procedures, evaluation purposes to encourage and improve teaching and research quality, and self-perfection-establishing timely perfect system. Evaluation should include teacher evaluation, student evaluation, and teaching organizations evaluation (including management, teaching design).

Some researchers proposed design steps of teaching quality plan in Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools in the field of higher education to collect and collate information, set basic documents, and generate quality plan document (Estacio and Karic 2015).

Some proposed countermeasures of teaching management system combined practice of Chinese-foreign cooperation in Zhejiang Forestry College. Education and Teaching Manage-

ment System of Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools in Mainland China include the introduction of foreign curriculum and optimization personnel training program, strengthen effective control of teaching process, quality control of student learning, and strengthen practice teaching and broaden student knowledge. Problems of school teaching management in Chinese-foreign cooperation in running schools that need to be improved are, perfect teaching programs of cooperative education, improve school management, improve teacher team building, achieve students communication, legal issues of cooperative education, and importance of training for managers (Seeber et al. 2016).

China also should take control of quality management to ensure its healthy development (Gonzalez and Sancho 2015).

Education Sovereignty of Chinese-foreign Cooperation Projects Operated by Running Schools among Higher Education in Mainland China

Some investigators believed that education sovereignty is one of the major theoretical issues in Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools in the field of higher education in Mainland China. He discussed several key issues in this field like management means, granting the certificate, introducing education resources and the quality of the teaching staff. Finally, he brought up some policies and suggestions for solving these problems (Russell 2015).

Some professors studied how to protect the education sovereignty. Firstly, he introduces the concepts of sovereignty, nation sovereignty and education sovereignty. Secondly, he addressed the relationship between education sovereignty and nation sovereignty and other things about them. Then he focused on the development of nation sovereignty and education sovereignty. Finally, he proposed some measures to safeguard the sovereignty of China's education. These measures are:

1. The country should establish a correct and up-to-date concept of education sovereignty.
2. It should understand the rules of the WTO and improve the relevant laws and regulations.

3. It is positive for one to carry out the "going out" strategy, and make efforts to exploit the international education market to spread the excellent Chinese culture to the world.
4. It should deepen the reform of the educational system, and continue to improve China's international competitiveness and the strength of the education and enhance the ability to resist the invasion.
5. It should strengthen the education about patriotism and Chinese culture by some more effective educational forms.

Xu (2014) stated that Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools in the field of higher education become a hot topic in China, in which the debate about "educational sovereignty" is the most sensitive and controversial issue. How to understand the "education sovereignty" is becoming an essential and ever important question, with regard to the establishment, development, and evaluation of Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools in the field of higher education in Mainland China. She focused on the policy and problems, through which, a series of questions are being discussed. Such as, "what exactly are the fundamental rights given by the education sovereignty?", "Do the problems emerging from Sino-foreign educational cooperation mean that the "educational sovereignty" is being damaged?" and "What influence does educational sovereignty have in the practice of joint education?"

Analysis of High Quality Education Resources of Chinese-foreign Cooperation Projects Operated by Running Schools in the Field of Higher Education

Some experts thought that in order to introduce educational resources with high quality, the country must adhere to the principles of being beneficial to the students' growth and development, to the school capability construction and the improvement of the overall school running level, and to the national economic development, and promoting the balance and harmony of regional development. The country shall establish and perfect the guarantee measures to introduce education resources with high quality by establishing and improving various working mechanisms, adjusting the strategic lay-

out of introducing education resources with high quality, formulating managing policy measures, exploring the new way of cooperative school running, strengthening the initiative of cooperative school running, and building up the coordinative mechanism of introducing education resources with high quality. Meanwhile, the country should also increase financial and capital investment, create fine social environment and atmosphere, construct a team with high quality for the Sino-foreign cooperation in school running, and reinforce the theoretical research on Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools in the field of higher education in mainland of China (Viczo 2016).

Liu (2013) studied from three aspects: the significant of high quality education resources and features, the issues concerning the introduction of high quality education resources in Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools in the field of higher education in mainland China. At last, he presented some countermeasures.

Policy and Law Issues of Chinese-foreign Cooperation Projects Operated by Running Schools among Higher Education in Mainland China

Zou (2014) said that China has made great efforts in developing Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools in the field of higher education in Mainland China and primarily established "Articles of Chinese-foreign Education Cooperation" and its "implementation methods". However, the country also faced lots of legal issues in the implementation. Therefore, after analyzing the reality of Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools in the field of higher education and its legal issues, he focused on developing the legislation with the expectation that the Chinese-foreign education cooperation more in accordance with the needs of international education from an international and global view. Zou wanted to solve the problems such as education sovereign, lag of theory about opening up international trade and services, lag of domestic education legislation and conflict between domestic law and international law. Through learning good experience from the developed countries including UK, US, Australia and Hong Kong, China would establish the education sov-

ereign development concept and hold on to its divisibility and level, amend the relative education regulations, taking the "Chinese-foreign education cooperation going-out strategy" into account, to improve the Chinese-foreign education cooperation system and make it better developed.

Yi (2012) felt that the Chinese-foreign cooperation project operated by the running school is the outcome of the reform and opening-up and the reform of higher educational system, which is an educational service trading activity concerning foreign affairs based on the state law authorization. With the constant acceleration of the educational internationalization course, the comprehensive development of Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools problems with the educational sovereign rights, retribution, applicable law, Chinese and foreign legal origin and the difference and conflict of the legal systems, the usage of teaching language, property definition, and the legal definition of preferential policy, have been foregrounding. The country should take the measures to practically safeguard educational sovereign rights, strengthen and perfect the legal construction of Chinese-foreign cooperation in running school, to give clear and definite and concrete definition to the educational public benefit and educational investment returns in legislation, to solve the legal conflicts by applying to the most significant connection theory, to clarify the difference between the basic teaching language and the foreign language teaching legally, and to standardize the capital of Sino-foreign cooperation in school-running according to the law.

Mao (2011) held the idea that provisions about the current Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools are internal documents and regulations promoted by functional departments, not only the lower level of legislation, legislative technique rough, and there are contradictory norms, the lack of systematic coordination, domestic law and international conflict, which has greatly influenced the educational services in China trade legislation applicability, consistency and transparency. Therefore, how to establish WTO/GATS framework, combined with the international rule of law, improving Chinese-foreign cooperative school of relevant legislation and the promotion of rapid development of trade in education services has great significance in theory and practice.

China should have its own national policy on higher education internationalization to ensure its communication (Zakaria et al. 2016).

Typical Cases of Chinese-foreign Cooperation Projects Operated by Running Schools among Higher Education in Mainland China

Chen (2009) pointed out that after twenty-three years of construction and development, the Chinese-American culture studies center of Nanjing university had become a successful example of cooperation between China and the United States in the field of education and academic cooperation, and its high level of education has been unanimously approved by China and the United States. The successful experience can be summarized as: a clear positioning, selecting high-quality partners, hiring high-level teachers, setting up special courses, creating first-class teaching model, carrying out high-quality academic activities, building first-class library, Providing a comprehensive system of employment guidance, the implementation of democratic management, and the organization of rich after-school activities.

Hu (2011) summarized Chinese-foreign cooperation organizations in terms of a basic theory, taking the College of International Business, Shenyang Normal University as an example. He investigated Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools in the field of higher education in the mainland of China on the foundation of present situation with comprehensive related subject theory, the visual angle with the anatomy in-depth. Then he suggested some personal viewpoints having been carried out reasonable demonstration. Such practice for Chinese-foreign cooperation in running schools will offer valuable reference.

Others started from discussing the definition, causing factors, importance, development history, feasibility and problems of Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools in the field of higher education in the mainland of China. Then he shared ten successful experiences to research the reason why Johns Hopkins University-Nanjing University Center for Chinese and American Studies became so successful, so as to provide referential meaning and great significance Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools. He concluded with successful experiences of locat-

ing definitely, selecting high-level partner, hiring excellent professors, opening unique courses, offering first rank teaching model, launching high quality academic activities, supplying top-ranking library, all-roundly and systematically careers guidance, democratic management, and colorful extracurricular activities (Duong and Chua 2015).

Marketing Strategy for Chinese-foreign Cooperation Projects Operated by Running Schools among Higher Education in Mainland China

Yu (2013) described the status of Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools. In recent years, many organizations and institutions of Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools made marketing for profits. She made market choice for this college by segmentation, targeting and positioning, trying to develop marketing strategies for their own development. Finally, she proposed the college marketing strategy could be implemented smoothly with safeguards. These marketing strategies and safeguards provide guidance on the development of the college of Chinese-foreign cooperation in running schools in higher education in Mainland China.

Xu (2012) analyzed the present situation on Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools in the field of higher education in the mainland of China including the past, present and the activating reasons from domestic and foreign aspects. Then he mainly discussed the marketing environment about the Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools and analyzed the advantages and risks with SWOT methodology. What is more is that, he pointed out some important problems. Last, he showed the choices of marketing strategies such as branding strategies, product strategies, price strategies, place strategies and promotion strategies and so on. Strategies will give possible solutions to the presented problems.

From the foregoing study it can be evaluated that, there are 8 central issues on trends of Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools in the field of higher education in Chinese mainland. They are all the reflection of the reality. The current status shows that progress is the key tone. It goes without saying that the development of Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools in

the field will really mean a great deal for Chinese higher education. China should learn from developed countries to form suitable modes of their own. The student management, teacher management, tuition management and quality management should also be paid emphasis on. On the other hand, education sovereignty should still be there. Policy and law issues related should be set up accordingly. Besides these 8 hot points, researches on Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools in the field of higher education in Chinese mainland should need more data and more investigation to support. That will be the new trends on Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools in the field of higher education in Chinese mainland.

CONCLUSION

The status quo of Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools in the field of higher education in Chinese mainland have been depicted in literature review in this paper. According to the major work done in this sector, there are 8 issues concerning the researches on Chinese-foreign cooperation projects have been categorized. Except for the eight major issues cited in this article, there are also some studies including side effects and curriculum design for Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools in the field of higher education in Chinese mainland. It should be said that the theoretical study of Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools in the field of higher education has promoted the concrete practice and mutually reinforced. The results generated from the literature review illustrated that significant progress has been made in the field of Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools in the field of higher education during last thirty years. Coming to the macro-level, various policies and laws have been promoted by the Chinese government to ensure the effectiveness of the cooperation. Coming to the micro-level, the cooperation projects in higher education in Chinese mainland serve as key components of civilization, internationalization and globalization.

At present, a lot of progress has been made in the theoretical breadth, application and operability aspects of Chinese-foreign cooperation

projects operated by running schools in the field of higher education in Mainland China. At the same time, one could not ignore the existence of some negative issues and defects. Chinese education with international standards is still in the trial and exploratory period. On one hand, the country is exposed to the great trend of economic globalization, various resources included, and on the other hand, there is a great gap between the foreign education system and Chinese one. Therefore, as an important form of education Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools in the field of higher education in Mainland China is bound to encounter a variety of contradictions and problems.

Turns out, both students and teachers have been exposed to great changes generated by Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools in the field of higher education in Chinese mainland. Considerable researches have been published illustrating that the Chinese-foreign cooperation project operated by running schools in the field of higher education is very popular. However, the majority of the researches are empirical researches, lacking supporting data, research methods and research design. Thus, the outcomes lack reliability. Chinese scholars have promoted a variety of research parameters for the Chinese-foreign cooperation projects. Unfortunately, a majority of them have just been studied superficially. Therefore, there is great room for scholars to improve their studies. There are many practitioners holding avid interest in conducting related researches concerning Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools in the field of higher education. This is very promising, as their participation will ultimately enrich the current studies concerning primary issues. This is because most of them are working on the frontier of the implementation Chinese-foreign cooperation projects operated by running schools in the field of higher education in Chinese mainland.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This work is supported by the General Project of Chinese Humanities and Social Sciences, China (No.10YJA880003).

REFERENCES

- Allemann-Ghionda C 2014. Internationalization and diversity in higher education: On the change of discourse and practice. *Zeitschrift Fur Padagogik*, 60: 668-680.

- Anderson T 2015. Seeking internationalization: The state of Canadian higher education. *Canadian Journal of Higher Education*, 45: 166-187.
- Anoshkova TA 2015. Implementation of global competency in higher education. *Advanced Education*, 3: 4-8.
- Araya-Ramírez I, Quiros-Arias L, Ruiz-Hernandez A 2015. Globalization of higher education: Experience of the school of geographic sciences, national university. *Revista Geografica De America*, 15-47.
- Castro P, Woodin J, Lundgren U, Byram M 2016. Student mobility and internationalisation in higher education: Perspectives from practitioners. *Language & Intercultural Communication*, 16: 418-436.
- Chang DF 2015. Implementing internationalization policy in higher education explained by regulatory control in neoliberal times. *Asia Pacific Education Review*, 16: 603-612.
- Chen HH 2009. Research on excellent Chinese-foreign cooperation in running schools-taking Chinese-American culture studies center of Nanjing university. *Journal of Huadong Normal University*, 4: 45-49.
- Chow ASY, Loo BPY 2015. Applying a world-city network approach to globalizing higher education: conceptualization, data collection and the lists of world cities. *Higher Education Policy*, 28: 107-126.
- Delbanco A 2015. Financing American higher education in the era of globalization. *New York Review of Books*, 62: 38-41.
- Deschamps E, Lee JJ 2015. Internationalization as mergers and acquisitions: Senior international officers' entrepreneurial strategies and activities in public universities. *Journal of Studies in International Education*, 19: 122-139.
- Dong SF 2012. Initial exploration on some issues of Chinese-foreign cooperation in running schools. *Journal of Contemporary Education Forum*, 1: 123-124.
- Duong VA, Chua CSK 2015. English as a symbol of internationalization in higher education: A case study of Vietnam. *Higher Education Research & Development*, 35: 669-683.
- Engwall L 2016. The internationalization of higher education. *European Review*, 24: 221-231.
- Estacio EV, Karic T 2015. The world cafe: An innovative method to facilitate reflections on internationalisation in higher education. *Journal of Further & Higher Education*, 40: 731-745.
- Goldstein HA 2014. The globalization of higher education. *Journal of Regional Science*, 54: 528-531.
- Gonzalez-Such J, Sancho-Alvarez C 2015. The internationalization of higher education: Institutional, organizational and ethical perspectives. *Revista De Education*, 370: 259-261.
- Gopal A, Zha Q 2015. Internationalisation of higher education and global mobility. *Educational Review*, 67: 386-388.
- Gopinath D 2015. Characterizing Indian students pursuing global higher education: A conceptual framework of pathways to internationalization. *Journal of Studies in International Education*, 19: 283-305.
- Hu J 2011. Practice study of Chinese-foreign cooperation in running schools - Taking international business school of Shenyang normal university as an example. *Journal of Shenyang Normal University*, 11: 52-58.
- Hu LC 2016. Interaction between human being and urban culture space: One of the motivations for higher education internationalization. *Integration of Education*, 20: 150-157.
- Jokila S 2015. The internationalization of higher education with Chinese characteristics: Appadurai's ideas explored. *Asia Pacific Journal of Education*, 35: 125-139.
- Kang SS 2012. Analysis of nature of product and its market in Chinese-foreign cooperation in running schools. *Journal of Yanshan University*, 6: 60-63.
- Larrinaga A, Amurrio M 2015. Internationalisation in higher education and its impact in multilingual contexts: Redefining identities of Basque-speaking academics. *Language Culture and Curriculum*, 28: 158-169.
- Larsen MA 2015. Internationalization in Canadian higher education: A case study of the gap between official discourses and on-the-ground realities. *Canadian Journal of Higher Education*, 45: 101-122.
- Le-Ha P, Barnawi OZ 2015. Where English neoliberalism, desire and internationalization are alive and kicking: Higher education in Saudi Arabia today. *Language and Education*, 29: 545-565.
- Lepori B, Seeber M, Bonaccorsi A 2015. Competition for talent: Country and organizational-level effects in the internationalization of European higher education institutions. *Research Policy*, 44: 789-802.
- Li CB 2012. Thing of teacher construction on Chinese-foreign cooperation in running schools. *Journal of Wuxi Vocational College*, 1: 12-15.
- Lin JH, Liu MJ 2013. Quality construction of Sino-foreign cooperation in running schools. *Journal of Education Research*, 1: 12-16.
- Liu Z 2013. Study of introducing high quality education resources in Chinese-foreign cooperation in running schools. *Journal of Vocational Education Communication*, 2: 22-25.
- Lu GS, Kang H, Yan N 2013. Chinese-foreign cooperation in running schools: Current situation, problems and development strategy. *Journal of Higher Engineering Education Research*, 2: 15-20.
- Mao D 2011. Research on law issues of Chinese-foreign cooperation in running schools: Post graduate dissertations. *Journal of Liaoning University*, 7: 80-88.
- Mok KH 2015. Higher education transformations for global competitiveness: Policy responses, social consequences and impact on the academic profession in Asia. *Higher Education Policy*, 28: 1-15.
- Ning W 2015. China in the process of globalization highlighting the humanistic spirit in the age of globalization: Humanities education in China. *European Review*, 23: 273-285.
- Pashby K, de Oliveira AV 2016. Ethical internationalisation in higher education: Interfaces with international development and sustainability. *Environmental Education Research*, 22: 771-787.
- Russell E 2015. The internationalization of emerging market higher education providers: Exploring transnational provision. *International Journal of Business and Society*, 16: 261-280.

- Samier EA 2015. The globalization of higher education as a societal and cultural security problem. *Policy Futures in Education*, 13: 683-702.
- Seeber M, Cattaneo M, Huisman, J, Paleari S 2016. Why do higher education institutions internationalize? An investigation of the multilevel determinants of internationalization rationales. *Higher Education*, 72: 685-702.
- Sevilla A 2015. Computer assisted language learning and the internationalisation of the Portuguese language in higher education contexts. *Digital Education Review*, 28: 37-44.
- Shahjahan RA, Madden M 2015. Uncovering the images and meanings of international organizations (IOs) in higher education research. *Higher Education*, 69: 705-717.
- Song ZJ 2011. Study on education management problems of Chinese-foreign cooperation in running schools. *Journal of Yanshan University*, 6: 42-45.
- Stein S 2016. Rethinking the ethics of internationalization: Five challenges for higher education. *Interactions: UCLA Journal of Education & Information Studies*, 12: 1-23.
- Stein S, de OA V, Bruce J, Susa R 2016. Towards different conversations about the internationalization of higher education. *Comparative & International Education*, 45: 1-18.
- Stukalova I, Shishkin A, Stukalova A 2015. Internationalization of higher education: A case of Russian universities. *Economics & Sociology*, 8: 275-286.
- Suleyman DG 2015. Evaluation of leadership behaviors of middle administrators in higher education through reflection. *The Anthropologist*, 20: 407-415.
- Takalani SM, Humbulani NM 2015. Education as an essential service: Does South Africa have sufficient support services to turn education into an essential service. *International Journal of Educational Sciences*, 10: 428-434.
- Viczko T 2016. Performing internationalization of higher education in Canadian national policy. *Canadian Journal of Higher Education*, 46: 1-18.
- Wang YZ 2010. Analysis on tuition situation of Chinese-foreign cooperation in running schools. *Journal of Yanshan University*, 2: 46-49.
- Wei SQ 2012. Research on mode of Chinese-foreign cooperation in running schools. *Journal of Yangzhou University*, 1: 25-28.
- Xia ZQ 2016. A study on teaching quality guarantee in Sino-Foreign cooperative education. *China Adult Education*, 9: 105-107.
- Xu Y 2012. Research on marketing strategy for Chinese-foreign cooperation in running schools - taking HB college as an example. *Journal of Huazhong University*, 9: 58-65.
- Xu ZL 2014. Rational thinking of education sovereignty under background of globalization-taking Chinese-foreign cooperation in running schools for an example. *Journal of Huadong Normal University*, 5: 60-66.
- Yang H 2014. Initial exploration on mode of Chinese-foreign cooperation in running schools. *Journal of Education Review*, 4: 4-9.
- Yemini M 2015. Internationalization of higher education in East Asia: Trends of student mobility and impact on education governance. *Compare - A Journal of Comparative and International Education*, 5: 830-831.
- Yi L 2012. Law issues and its solution to Chinese-foreign cooperation in running schools. *Journal of Education Research*, 6: 20-22.
- Yu KS 2013. Marketing strategy for Chinese-foreign cooperation in running schools in ZM college. *Journal of Anhui University*, 3: 2-10.
- Zakaria M, Janjua SY, Bashir AF 2016. Internationalization of higher education: Trends and policies in Pakistan. *Bulletin of Education & Research*, 38: 75-88.
- Zhadovets NV 2015. Problems and prospects of internationalization of Israeli higher education. *Vestnik Tomskogo Gosudarstvennogo Universiteta-Istoriya*, 3: 79-85.
- Zou JH 2014. Law issues of Chinese-foreign cooperation in running schools. *Journal of Beijing Foreign Studies University*, 3: 10.

Paper received for publication on November 2016
Paper accepted for publication on May 2017